Major Problems in American Environmental History

Not For Sale

Not For Sale

MAJOR PROBLEMS IN AMERICAN HISTORY SERIES

GENERAL EDITOR

THOMAS G. PATERSON



Major Problems in American Environmental History

Documents and Essays

THIRD EDITION

EDITED BY

CAROLYN MERCHANT

University of California-Berkeley





For Sale

Major Problems in American Environmental History: Documents and Essays, Third Edition Carolyn Merchant

Senior Publisher: Suzanne Jeans Acquisitions Editor: Jeffrey Greene Development Editor: Larry Goldberg

Assistant Editor: Megan Chrisman Editorial Assistant: Patrick Roach Senior Media Editor: Lisa Ciccolo Manufacturing Manager: Marcia Locke

Marketing Manager: Katherine Bates

Marketing Coordinator: Lorreen Pelletier

MarComm Manager: Caitliln

Project Management: PreMediaGlobal

Senior Art Director: Cate Rickard

Senior Print Buyer: Sandra Milewski

Senior Rights Acquisitions Specialist: Jennifer Meyer Dare

Cover Designer: PreMediaGlobal

Cover Image: *Lackawanna Valley* by George Inness, 1855, The Granger Collection, New York

Back cover photograph of the author courtesy of Robert Holmgren

Compositor: PreMediaGlobal

© 2012, 2005 Wadsworth, Cengage Learning

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED. No part of this work covered by the copyright herein may be reproduced, transmitted, stored, or used in any form or by any means graphic, electronic, or mechanical, including but not limited to photocopying, recording, scanning, digitizing, taping, Web distribution, information networks, or information storage and retrieval systems, except as permitted under Section 107 or 108 of the 1976 United States Copyright Act, without the prior written permission of the publisher.

For product information and technology assistance, contact us at Cengage Learning Customer & Sales Support, 1-800-354-9706

For permission to use material from this text or product, submit all requests online at www.cengage.com/permissions

Further permissions questions can be emailed to permissionrequest@cengage.com

Library of Congress Control Number: 2011927036

ISBN-13: 978-0-495-91242-2

ISBN-10: 0-495-91242-5

Wadsworth

20 Channel Center Street Boston, MA 02210 USA

Cengage Learning is a leading provider of customized learning solutions with office locations around the globe, including Singapore, the United Kingdom, Australia, Mexico, Brazil and Japan. Locate your local office at international.cengage.com/region

Cengage Learning products are represented in Canada by Nelson Education, Ltd.

For your course and learning solutions, visit www.academic.cengage.com

Purchase any of our products at your local college store or at our preferred online store **www.cengagebrain.com**

Instructors: Please visit **login.cengage.com** and log in to access instructor-specific resources.



Contents

LIST OF MAPS xiv
PREFACE **
Chapter 1 What Is Environmental History? 1
essays 2
Donald Worster • Doing Environmental History 2
Jared Diamond • Predicting Environmental History 9
William Cronon • Using Environmental History 14
Carolyn Merchant • Interpreting Environmental History 19
J. Donald Hughes • Global Environmental History 25
further reading 31
Chapter 2 Native American Ecology and European Contact 33
DOCUMENTS 34
1. A Spanish Explorer Views the Pueblos, 1580 35
2. Spanish Explorers Observe Pueblo Irrigation, 1582 36
3. A Spaniard Testifies on the Effects of Pueblo Colonization, 1601 37
4. Nicolas Denys Describes the Micmac Fur Trade, 1672 40
5. A Jesuit Missionary Recalls Micmac Hunting Rituals, 1691 42
6. Lewis and Clark Describe the Great Plains, 1804 44
7. Plains Indians' Pictographs, Recorded by George Catlin in 1844 45
essays 48
Ramón Gutiérrez • Pueblos and Spanish in the Southwest 48
Calvin Martin • Micmacs and French in the Northeast 57
Andrew Isenberg • Indians and Bison on the Great Plains 65
FURTHER READING 69

vi CONTENTS

Chapter 3 The New England Forest in the Seventeenth Century 71

DOCUMENTS 72

- William Bradford Faces a "Hideous and Desolate Wilderness," 1620–1635 73
- 2. John Winthrop Sets Forth the Grounds for Settling in New England, 1629 77
- 3. Thomas Morton Praises the New English Canaan, 1632 78
- 4. William Wood Portrays Indian Women's Housing and Horticulture, 1634 79
- 5. Anne Bradstreet Eulogizes Nature, 1650 80
- Edward Johnson Describes the Transformation of the Wilderness,
 1654 81
- 7. A Timber Merchant's Estate, 1682 82
- 8. Cotton Mather Presents the Scale of Nature, 1721 84
- 9. A Governor Enforces the King's Forest Policy, 1730 85

ESSAYS 86

Jim O'Brien • A Beaver's Perspective on North American History 86
Samuel F. Manning • A Colonist's Perspective on the New England
Forest 92

Mark Stoll • Puritan Perspectives on the New England Environment 96

FURTHER READING 101

Chapter 4 Tobacco and Rice in the Colonial South 103

DOCUMENTS 103

- John White Depicts Indian Planting and Fishing in North Carolina, 1590 105
- 2. Virginia Settlers Discover Tobacco, 1614–1617 108
- 3. A Chesapeake Planter Describes His Holdings, 1686 109
- Robert Beverley Discourses on Indians and Nature in Virginia, 1705 110
- 5. A Governor Explains South Carolina Rice Production, 1761 112
- 6. A Traveler Describes Tobacco Cultivation, 1775 114
- 7. Thomas Jefferson Discusses the "Nature" of Blacks and Worn-Out Soils, 1787 117
- 8. Olaudah Equiano Describes His Enslavement, 1790 119

ESSAYS 122

Avery O. Craven • Tobacco and Soils in the Chesapeake 122

Judith Carney • Rice and Slaves in the Low Country 128

William Loren Katz • Black Indians in the South 131

Chapter 5 Farms and Cities in the Early Republic 137

DOCUMENTS 138

- J. Hector St. John de Crèvecoeur Asks, "What Is an American?"
 1782 139
- 2. Thomas Jefferson Extols the Agrarian Ideal, 1787 142
- Benjamin Rush Praises the Market Farmers of Pennsylvania, 1789 143
- 4. Anna Howell's Farm Diary, 1820 146
- 5. Samuel Slater's Proposal on Cotton Spinning, 1789 147
- Benjamin Henry Latrobe on Polluted Water in Philadelphia, 1798 149
- John James Audubon Depicts the Squatters of the Mississippi, 1808–1834 151
- 8. Calvin Colton on Self-Made Men, 1844 154

ESSAYS 154

Carolyn Merchant • Farms and Subsistence 155

Martin Melosi • Pollution and Cities 163

Theodore Steinberg • Water and Industry 168

FURTHER READING 173

Chapter 6 Nature and the Market in the Nineteenth Century 175

DOCUMENTS 175

- 1. Phillis Wheatley Eulogizes Nature, 1773 177
- 2. John James Audubon Describes Shooting Birds, 1808–1834 178
- 3. James Fenimore Cooper Laments the "Wasty Ways" of Pioneers, 1823 180
- Hudson River Painters Depict Nature and Civilization, 1836–1849 183
- 5. George Catlin on Indians, Nature, and Civilization, 1844 185
- 6. Ralph Waldo Emerson Expounds on Nature and Wealth, 1844 187
- 7. Henry David Thoreau on Nature Versus Civilization, 1854 190
- 8. Rebecca Harding Davis on Pollution and Human Life in the Iron Mills, 1861 194

ESSAYS 195

Michael Heiman • Civilization over Nature 196

Robert Kuhn McGregor • Nature over Civilization 202

Elizabeth D. Blum • Slave Women and Nature 20'



viii CONTENTS

Chapter 7 The Cotton South Before and After the Civil War 215

DOCUMENTS 216

- Frances Anne Kemble Discusses Slavery and Nature in Georgia, 1838–1839 217
- 2. A Georgia Planter Tells Why Cotton Pays, 1847 220
- Frederick Law Olmsted Describes Cotton Production and Environmental Deterioration, 1861 221
- 4. Sharecroppers' Contracts, 1876–1886 223
- Freed Slave Louis Hughes Describes Cotton Raising and Cotton Worms, 1897 224
- A Louisiana Convention Declares War on the Boll Weevil, 1903 228
- 7. Ex-Slaves Describe Their Means of Subsistence, 1937 231
- A Freed Slave Explains "Why That Boll Weevil Done Come,"
 1945 235

ESSAYS 235

Albert Cowdrey • Soils Used 236

Eugene Genovese • Soils Abused 238

Theodore Steinberg • Soils Extracted 242

FURTHER READING 249

Chapter 8 Extracting the Far West in the Nineteenth Century 251

DOCUMENTS 252

- 1. A Russian Sailor Depicts the Sea Otter Trade, 1813 253
- 2. A Manager Describes the Russian American Company, 1835 254
- 3. Senator Thomas Hart Benton Explains Manifest Destiny, 1846 257
- 4. A Federal Agent Assesses Mining's Impact on the Indians, 1853 258
- 5. James Marshall Tells How He Discovered Gold, 1857 259
- Joaquin Miller Reveals the Environmental Deterioration in the Gold Country, 1890 260
- 7. A Fish Commissioner Explains the Need for Salmon Protection, 1885 262
- 8. A Capitalist Advocates Salmon Hatcheries, 1893 263
- An Indian Woman Deplores the Soreness of the Land, Recorded in 1925 265

ESSAYS 266

James Gibson • Otters versus Russians in Alaska 267

Jessica Teisch • Miners versus Farmers in California 271

Richard White • Salmon versus Fishers in the Northwest 276

Chapter 9 Great Plains Grasslands Exploited 285

DOCUMENTS 286

- Women Homesteaders Portray the Plains Environment, 1857–1893 287
- 2. The Homestead Act, 1862 290
- Joseph G. McCoy Describes the Chisholm Trail and Abilene Stockyards, 1874 291
- Frederick Jackson Turner Explains the Significance of the Frontier in American History, 1893 293
- 5. John Steinbeck Depicts the Dust Bowl, 1939 295
- Plenty-coups Mourns the Vanishing Buffalo, Recorded in 1950 297
- 7. An Editor Bids Good Riddance to Buffalo, 1979 299

ESSAYS 300

Walter Prescott Webb • Great Plains Ecology 300

Donald Worster • Cowboy Ecology 307

William Cronon • Telling Stories About Ecology 314

FURTHER READING 323

Chapter 10 Resource Conservation in the Twentieth Century 325

DOCUMENTS 326

- George Perkins Marsh Discusses the Relationship of Man and Nature, 1864 327
- 2. John Wesley Powell Advocates Reclamation, 1878 329
- 3. The Reclamation Act, 1902 332
- 4. Theodore Roosevelt Publicizes Conservation, 1908 333
- 5. George L. Knapp Opposes Conservation, 1910 334
- Mrs. Marion Crocker Argues for the Conservation Imperative, 1912 336
- 7. Robert Marshall Advocates the People's Forests, 1933 338
- 8. Hugh Bennett Presses for Soil Conservation, 1947 339
- Gifford Pinchot Recalls the Origins of the Conservation Movement,
 1947 341

ESSAYS 343

Samuel P. Hays • From Conservation to Environment 343

Marc Reisner • Conservation as Reclamation 349

Carolyn Merchant • Women and Conservation 355



x CONTENTS

Chapter 11 Wilderness Preservation in the Twentieth Century 365

DOCUMENTS 365

- Florence Merriam Bailey Recalls the Early Audubon Women, 1900 366
- 2. Mary Austin Describes the Wonders of the Desert, 1903 367
- 3. John Muir Advocates Wilderness Preservation, 1912 369
- 4. The National Parks Act, 1916 371
- Chief Luther Standing Bear Gives an Indian View of Wilderness, Recorded in 1933 372
- 6. The Wilderness Act, 1964 372
- 7. Edward Abbey on Industrial Tourism in the National Parks, 1968 374

ESSAYS 378

Roderick Nash • The Value of Wilderness 378

Philip Burnham • Indians and Wilderness 385

William Cronon • The Trouble with Wilderness 393

FURTHER READING 401

Chapter 12 Urbanizing the Environment in the Twentieth Century 403

DOCUMENTS 404

- 1. A Woman Reformer Advocates Civic Cleanliness, 1901 404
- 2. Upton Sinclair Describes the Chicago Stockyards, 1905 406
- 3. Jane Addams Works to Control Garbage in Chicago, 1910 407
- Cartoonists Depict Gender and Environmental Politics, 1901–1915 410
- 5. A Black Migrant Experiences the Urban Environment, 1927 413
- 6. Alice Hamilton Discusses Industrial Poisons, 1943 414
- Dwight D. Eisenhower Promotes the Interstate Highway System,
 1955 416

ESSAYS 419

Robert Gottlieb • Industrial Pollution and Reform 420

Adam Rome • Masculinity and Environmental Reform 427

Paul Sutter • Automobiles and the Environment 433

FURTHER READING 439

Chapter 13 The Emergence of Ecology in the Twentieth Century 441

DOCUMENTS 442

- 1. Ellen Swallow Richards Defines Human Ecology, 1907 442
- 2. Frederic Clements Describes Plant Succession, 1916 444

446

6. Rachel Carson Warns of a Silent Spring, 1962 451
7. Eugene P. Odum Discusses the Stability of the Ecosystem, 1969 454
8. Pickett and White Explain Patch Dynamics, 1985 455
ESSAYS 456
Robert Clarke • Ellen Swallow Richards's Human Ecology 456
Donald Worster • Organic, Economic, and Chaotic Ecology 461
Linda Lear • Rachel Carson's Ecological Vision 473
further reading 479
Chapter 14 Water and Energy in the Twentieth Century 480
DOCUMENTS 480
1. President Franklin D. Roosevelt Dedicates Hoover Dam, 1935 482
2. The National Environmental Policy Act, 1969 484
3. Senator Gaylord Nelson Promotes the First Earth Day, 1970 486
4. Hopi Leaders Protest the Desecration of Their Sacred Lands, 1970 487
5. Barry Commoner on the Costs of Nuclear Energy, 1971 489
6. David Brower Protests the Damming of the West, 1990 492
7. A Reporter on the Human Costs of the Four Corners Coal Plant, 2007 497
ESSAYS 500
Charles Wilkinson • Water and the Environment 500
David E. Nye • Energy and the Environment 506
Adam Rome • The Environmental Movement 511
FURTHER READING 521
Chapter 15 Globalization: The United States in the Wider World 522
DOCUMENTS 523
 Carl Anthony Explains Why African Americans Should Be Environmentalists, 1990 524
2. Principles of Environmental Justice, 1991 526
3. Winona LaDuke on Native Struggles for Land and Life, 1999 528
4. Reporters Announce a World Population of Six Billion People,

5. The Johannesburg Declaration on Sustainable Development,

1999

3. Henry Gleason Explains Plant Associations, 19264. Arthur Tansley Introduces the Ecosystem, 1935

5. Aldo Leopold Proposes a Land Ethic, 1949 448

- 7. Al Gore Explains Why Global Warming is a Global Crisis, 2006 538
- 8. The Copenhagen Accord on Climate Change, 2009 543

ESSAYS 546

Eileen McGurty • Environmental Justice 547

Peter Borelli • Environmental Philosophy 554

Spencer Weart • Global Climate Change 560

FURTHER READING 567

GLOSSARY 568 TIMELINE 571



List of Maps

Map 1.1	Physiographic Map of the United States xviii
Map 2.1	Cultural Areas of Native Americans 32
Map 3.1	Forest Types at the Beginning of New England Settlement 70
Map 4.1	The Colonial Economy 102
Map 5.1	American Cities, 1820 and 1860 136
Map 6.1	Major Rivers, Roads, and Canals, 1825-1860 174
Map 7.1	Southern Cotton Production, 1820 and 1860 214
Map 8.1	Trails to the West, 1840 250
Map 9.1	Average Annual Precipitation 284
Map 10.1	The "Old Northwest" and the Land Ordinance of 1785 324
Map 11.1	Western Indian Reservations, 1890 364
Map 12.1	American Industry in 1900 402
Map 13.1	Natural Vegetation of the United States 440

Not For Sale



Preface

Birds or oil? Ecology or economy? Nature or capital? The Gulf of Mexico oil spill on April 20, 2010, was a striking example of a major problem in American environmental history. The conflict is one between two approaches to knowledge, economy and ecology—both rooted in the Greek word oikos, meaning home or household. Economy is the management of the household, ecology the study of the household. Economic systems are managed for profit at the expense of ecological externalities. Ecological systems are open systems in which matter and energy flow across boundaries. In the BP spill, oil escaping from well casings and blowout preventers was moved by ocean currents and winds across the boundaries, booms, and berms set up to contain its spread. Plankton, corals, and fish were depleted of life-sustaining oxygen; fishers, oil workers, chefs, and waiters of life-sustaining work. All are part of humanity's larger planetary home—the oikos.

Environmental history illuminates the larger problems underlying current conflicts such as oil spills, forest depletion, and climate change. Insights into issues such as those in the BP oil spill can be found in this volume. Thus in Chapter 13 on the history of ecology, Donald Worster, Robert Clarke, and Linda Lear show how ecology as a science encompasses the entire human home and provides insights into how that home can be sustained. In Chapter 14 on water and energy, David Nye looks at the history of the choices society has made over the development of energy sources, whereas Adam Rome points out that in response to the 1969 Union Oil spill in Santa Barbara, California, thousands of demonstrators protested the unchecked power of "big oil." And in Chapter 15, reporters discuss the relevance of world population growth to the debate over economy versus ecology, and Al Gore and Spencer Weart look at alternatives to fossil fuels in the debate over climate change.

Why do people study environmental history? Today, interest in the earth—its past, present, and future—commands worldwide attention. The 2009 Conference on Climate Change in Copenhagen, Denmark, brought together

government leaders and environmental organizations from around the globe to address the problem of global warming, one of the topics explored in Chapter 15. As concern mounts over the quality of environments and human life in the future, the study of past environments—how they were used and how they changed—provides guidance for the formation of governmental policy. Leaders can learn from environmental history. Thus the rise of salmon fisheries in the Pacific Northwest and the role played in their depletion by the construction of dams for energy and flood control affect future policies on whether to build dams (or to decommission existing dams), a topic explored in Chapters 8 and 14. Environmental conditions also influence policy decisions. Urbanization of the American West, where droughts are all too frequent, prompts governmental funding of reclamation projects and soil conservation, as well as the interstate highway system linking east with west—themes explored in Chapters 9, 10, and 14. Environmental history, moreover, instills an appreciation of the complexity of human interactions with nature, and in this way contributes to a fuller understanding of history. Thus knowledge of rice cultivation by African slaves in the Southeast and of corn cultivation by Pueblo Indians in the Southwest casts new light on the conflicts that arose among the races and cultures of those regions, as Chapters 2 and 4 examine. Further, environmental history illuminates the different effects that forests, farms, and cities have on local environments, as Chapters 3, 5, and 12 reveal.

And there are still other reasons to study environmental history. Historical writings about nature offer aesthetic or spiritual perceptions of humanity's place in the natural world that continue to inspire respect and reverence for nature and to foster the conservation and preservation of nature. Poets who wrote about the natural world, such as Puritan Anne Bradstreet and slave Phyllis Wheatley; the Hudson River School of painters; New England transcendentalists, among them Ralph Waldo Emerson and Henry David Thoreau; and nature writers John Muir and Mary Austin initiated an appreciation of wilderness that influenced the creation of the national parks, a subject treated in Chapters 6 and 11. Gender and race also play critical roles in environmental activism. Women and men, blacks and whites, often perceive the environment differently and contribute diverse approaches to environmental movements as revealed in Chapters 12, 13, and 15. Such histories and case studies offer valuable perspectives to a world whose very survival depends on shifting from exploitative to environmentally sustainable development, and from inequality to environmental justice.

New to the Third Edition

The third edition of Major Problems in American Environmental History retains the broad goals of the first and second editions set out in the preceding paragraphs, as well as the basic structure of the book, and its most popular and successful documents and essays, making for a smooth transition to the use of the third edition in the classroom. The third edition, however, includes new topics and new scholarship in the chapters on the twentieth century in which environmental issues are rapidly evolving.

xvi PREFACE

New material is included on global environmental history, climate change, the environmental movement, recreation, and environmental health. New documents highlight the work of environmentalists Gaylord Nelson on the first Earth Day in 1970, David Brower on the problem of dams in the West, and Al Gore on climate change. New essays on global environmental history by J. Donald Hughes and the history of global warming by Spencer Weart bookend the volume. A major emphasis on the twentieth century has been continued, and those chapters have been updated. Included here are essays by Robert Gottlieb and Adam Rome on politics and masculinity in urban reform movements, a sharper focus on water and energy in the American Southwest, and new material by Paul Sutter on the role of the automobile in promoting consumer culture and national park tourism.

One of the strongest features of the book is the inclusion of the voices of people of color and women, and those contributions have been retained in the third edition. The roles of minorities and their interactions with each other and the environment are emphasized in essays by Andrew Isenberg on Indians and bison on the Great Plains; Judith Carney on "black rice" in South Carolina; William Katz on "black Indians;" Elizabeth Blum on slave women's views of wilderness; Philip Burnham on Indians and the National Parks; Eileen McGurty on the origins of the environmental justice movement; Carl Anthony on African Americans and the environment; Winona LaDuke on native struggles for land and life; and the Principles of Environmental Justice from the People of Color Environmental Leadership Summit. Women in the conservation, urban reform, and environmental movements appear as voices of change in the twentieth century, while Rosemary Radford Ruether highlights the role of ecofeminism as a global force in the twenty-first century.

Greater attention is likewise paid to international connections and globalization that reveal the historical and current roles played by the United States in the wider world. Historical influences on the North American environment, in addition to those of Europeans and Africans on the East Coast, include those of the French in Canada, the Spanish in Mexico and New Mexico, and the Russians in Alaska. Current international issues are reflected in the Johannesburg Earth Summit on Sustainable Development, the Copenhagen Conference on Climate Change, and why global warming is a global crisis. The book also incorporates new directions taken in the field over the past decade, such as that taken by Jared Diamond in *Guns, Germs, and Steel*, Mark Stoll on the New England Puritans, Jessica Teisch on *Engineering Nature*, William Cronon on the meaning and value of wilderness, and Linda Lear on Rachel Carson's ecological vision.

Structure, Scope, and Aims of the Third Edition

The third edition of *Major Problems in American Environmental History* is the result of more than four decades of the growth of the field of environmental history. This volume, like its companions in the Major Problems in American History series, draws on both documents and essays. It is intended as a primary text in a one- or two-term environmental history or environmental studies course, but it

also may be assigned to provide an environmental dimension to introductory classes in U.S. history. Chapter introductions discuss the place, period, and particular focus of each case history. The documents for each chapter provide a variety of perspectives written or spoken by those who lived in and helped to create the history of a specific environment. These primary sources stimulate students to form their own opinions on environmental history and, through discussion with others, to develop confidence in their own interpretations. The essays offer a range of views, demonstrating that scholars often draw conflicting conclusions from the same primary sources. This format encourages students to evaluate each interpretation, as well as to gain an understanding of the ways in which different underlying assumptions and positions influence the writing of history. It is hoped that the third edition, like the first and second, engages and challenges students to think critically about the American past and the role the environment has played and will play in the global future. This edition includes the glossary from the earlier editions, plus a timeline and integrates within the chapters a set of maps for reference to geographical regions, natural resources, and environmental conditions in various places and periods of history.

Acknowledgments

In compiling the third edition, I am grateful for contributions, suggestions, and evaluations from my students and teaching assistants over the past several years. I am also indebted to Sarah Thomas who collected and helped to evaluate the many outstanding articles and chapters recommended by reviewers and updated the Further Readings. I am grateful for the excellent suggestions made by Dylan Esson regarding the inclusion of particular documents and essays and ideas for truncating others.

The following reviewers of the third edition offered many helpful suggestions and helped shape and strengthen the volume: Andrew Graybill, University of Nebraska—Lincoln; Dwight Henderson, University of Texas at San Antonio; Connie Lester, University of Central Florida; James Longhurst, The University of Wisconsin—La Crosse; and Paul Rosier, Villanova University. Thomas Paterson, general editor of the Major Problems in American History series, was extraordinarily helpful in framing the scope of each edition. I am grateful to my editor Jeffrey Greene, to Larry Goldberg who oversaw the copyediting, and to Rathi Thirumalai and PreMediaGlobal for producing the volume. Finally, I am deeply indebted to Charles Sellers, who over the years has profoundly influenced my interpretation of American history and helped me to conceptualize my approach to in environmental history.

I welcome readers' feedback on and suggestions for improving this anthology. I also would be interested in receiving copies of supplementary chapters that instructors or students create or other projects that grow out of the study of this volume.

C. M.

Not For Sale